

Huw Irranca-Davies AS/MS
Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ac Ysgrifennydd y Cabinet dros
Newid Hinsawdd a Materion Gwledig
Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Climate
Change and Rural Affairs



Llywodraeth Cymru
Welsh Government

Ein cyf/Our ref: MA/HIDCC//0865/25

Peredur Owen Griffiths MS
Chair
Finance Committee
Welsh Parliament
Cardiff Bay
Cardiff
CF99 1SN

25 April 2025

Dear Peredur,

Thank you for your Stage 1 Report on the Disused Mine and Quarry Tips (Wales) Bill that was published on 4 April. Please see below my responses to the recommendations set out in your report.

Recommendation 1. The Committee recommends that the Welsh Government shares the evidence it has received from other bodies which was used to inform the costs of the Bill with the Committee ahead of the Stage 1 debate and provides an updated Regulatory Impact Assessment to reflect this information following Stage 2 proceedings.

Response – Accept

Whilst I am content to accept the recommendation, it is not always possible to provide a specific document or spreadsheet as evidence for inclusion in the RIA this is due to the need to capture information from various sources. I can confirm that my officials have and will continue to work closely with other bodies to inform the estimated costs and in particular information has been incorporated from the Mining Remediation Authority (MRA), Natural Resources Wales (NRW), Welsh Local Government Association (WLGA), Planning and Environment Decisions Wales (PEDW) and MEDR.

On this basis, I think it would be sensible for me to confirm the source of any information contained in the RIA.

Canolfan Cyswllt Cyntaf / First Point of Contact Centre:
0300 0604400

Bae Caerdydd • Cardiff Bay
Caerdydd • Cardiff
CF99 1SN

Gohebiaeth.Huw.Irranca-Davies@llyw.cymru
Correspondence.Huw.Irranca-Davies@gov.wales

Rydym yn croesawu derbyn gohebiaeth yn Gymraeg. Byddwn yn ateb gohebiaeth a dderbynnir yn Gymraeg yn Gymraeg ac ni fydd gohebu yn Gymraeg yn arwain at oedi.

We welcome receiving correspondence in Welsh. Any correspondence received in Welsh will be answered in Welsh and corresponding in Welsh will not lead to a delay in responding.

Operational staffing costs – advice on the likely staffing costs for the Authority was obtained from the MRA based on its experience of the current inspection regime. They provided information on the number of hours, at each grade, required to undertake each of the tasks within the regime (preliminary assessment, full assessment, management plans, general inspection and detailed inspections). We used this information to estimate a minimum staffing level required to carry out the functions of the Authority (estimates have been included in the RIA under section 8.76). The MRA have confirmed that they thought our estimates were fair and reasonable.

Senior appointments costs – advice on the cost of recruitment of senior appointments has been verified with recruitment consultants and psychometric test providers. Remuneration for senior appointments, including the Board members have been sense-checked with NRW recruitment adverts and advice by officials who implemented the Tertiary Education and Research (Wales) Bill.

Advice on cost of appeals – Advice on the average cost of an appeal (including daily inspectors and administrative rates) was provided by PEDW, and from experience of operating the Marine Licensing appeals system.

Cost of Personal Protective Equipment (PPE) and vehicle leasing – advice on the cost of PPE was provided by PEDW and the assumptions on the amount of equipment needed was provided by the MRA. MRA also advised on the leasing assumptions used in ascertaining the vehicle leasing cost in the RIA.

Non-staff costs - Digital – advice on the costs of the digital equipment was provided by officials who implemented the Tertiary Education and Research (Wales) Bill, who delivered the IT platform and system to budget for MEDR. Each component of Digital spend (such as laptops, office 365 subscriptions, system licensing or annual support) has been verified by live prices available by reputable suppliers.

Office costs – advice on the costs of the location costs was provided by officials in the Facilities team in the Corporate Services Division, where Welsh Government offices/spaces have been rented out to other ALB's or organisations.

Recommendation 2. The Committee recommends that the Welsh Government shares the data it has used to calculate the benefits arising from the Bill, particularly those relating to cost savings related to the creation of the Disused Tips Authority, ahead of the Stage 1 debate and provides an updated Regulatory Impact Assessment following Stage 2 proceedings.

Response - Accept

I am happy to accept this recommendation, and the data used to calculate the benefits arising from the bill have been included as an Annex 1 to this letter. I will instruct my officials to update the RIA following stage 2 proceedings.

Recommendation 3. The Committee recommends that the Welsh Government confirms how the Disused Tips Authority will prioritise applications for funding to ensure these are provided to those areas at greater risk on a needs basis.

Response – Accept

Whilst I am not able to pre-empt how the Authority will choose to prioritise its funding and its approach to applications for the coal tip safety grant, I am able to confirm how Welsh Government prioritises applications at the current time, which will form the basis of guidance that will be made available to the Authority.

Applications made to the Coal Tip Safety Grant Scheme are appraised against a number of factors:

- category of the tip;
- the potential for mitigating risk factors and;
- project feasibility and viability within the scope and terms of the scheme.

I can confirm that applications made for higher rated tips are prioritised over those for lower rated tips, if the proposed works are feasible and deliverable.

Recommendation 4. The Committee recommends that the Welsh Government continues its work with Audit Wales to ensure that the relevant cost estimates are robust and are reflected in an updated Regulatory Impact Assessment after Stage 2.

Response - Accept

I am happy to accept this recommendation and can confirm that an updated RIA will be provided after stage 2.

Recommendation 5. The Committee recommends that the Welsh Government provides a further breakdown of staff costs arising from the establishment of the new Authority and assurances that the level of remuneration are appropriate and demonstrate value for money.

Response - Accept

I am happy to accept this recommendation and provide clarification of the costs used - I attach a revised breakdown of staffing costs for the Authority in Annex 2 to this letter which will be used to amend the RIA after stage 2.

I can confirm that the approach taken in this document is in line with the HM Treasury Green Book guidance on producing economic appraisals. This means that the annual cost of salaries displayed is the total staff cost to the Authority – which includes employer national insurance contributions and employer pension contributions.

Recommendation 6. The Committee recommends that the Welsh Government confirms whether funding allocations for bodies whose responsibilities will transfer to the Disused Tips Authority will be subject to change and that this information, including amounts involved, is included in an updated Regulatory Impact Assessment after Stage 2.

Response - Accept

I am happy to accept this recommendation and will consider how I can update the RIA after stage 2 to make the position clearer

I can confirm:

- funding currently allocated to the MRA for the inspection regime will transfer to the authority from 1 April 2027;
- funding allocated to local authorities through the RSG will not be subject to change. This is primarily because whilst LA's will lose some responsibility under the new regime, they will retain the responsibility for the tips that they own and maintain;
- funding for the coal tip safety grant will transfer from Welsh Government to the Authority on the 1 April 2027.

Recommendation 7. The Committee recommends that the Welsh Government continues to work with the Welsh Local Government Association to maintain the skills base within its workforce in light of the establishment of the Disused Tips Authority.

Response – Accept

I am happy to accept this recommendation and can confirm that alongside the WLGA, NRW and MRA we have undertaken a capability assessment,

My officials will continue to work with partners to discuss, identify and support new technological developments which could be used to assist the work in this area and identify future skills requirements.

Early discussions are also continuing with officials responsible for apprenticeships and post 16 education and MEDR to identify opportunities that might be available to create a pipeline of new talent to address the skills gaps and create a long-term strategy.

My Officials have also looked at wider opportunities to help address skill gaps having had discussions with Talent Beyond Boundaries (TBB) who launched their programme, in Wales, in September. The aim being to match internationally displaced skilled workers with Welsh employers to address skills shortages. This scheme is also available to local authorities and other organisations to use to address skills gaps. Officials plan to introduce the scheme to WLGA, local authorities, MRA and NRW at the Coal Tip Safety Technical Working Group.

Recommendation 8. The Committee recommends that the Welsh Government shares the evidence it has considered when determining the level of contingency required to support the Bill ahead of the Stage 1 debate and in an updated Regulatory Impact Assessment after Stage 2.

Response – Accept in principle

Whilst I am content to accept the principle of the recommendation, I think the RIA is clear that we have estimated the contingency provision based on discussions with stakeholders who have recently been involved in setting up new bodies.

Given that we have provided an estimate of the costs of the new body (rather than as a range), we believed that a contingency of 25% on non-staff costs and 5% on staff costs is sensible and pragmatic way to factor in unknowns, and incorporate potential project risks such as market price volatility, or variance in the pay scales / bands that the new Authority decides to use.

Recommendation 9. The Committee recommends that any post implementation review undertaken by the Welsh Government assesses the overall costs and benefits of the Bill and whether this meets the expectations set out in the Regulatory Impact Assessment.

Response – Accept

I am happy to accept this recommendation and can confirm that the post implementation review, will include an assessment of the overall costs and benefits.

If you have any further questions, please let me know.

Your sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be 'Huw Irranca-Davies', written in a cursive style.

Huw Irranca-Davies AS/MS

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ac Ysgrifennydd y Cabinet dros Newid Hinsawdd
a Materion Gwledig

Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Climate Change and Rural Affairs

Annex 1: Benefits calculations

Table 1: Area of coal tips by local authority

Local Authority	Area of Tips (m²)	Local authority Area (m²)	Local authority area covered (%)
Blaenau Gwent	10,597,263.2	108,728,046.1	9.75
Bridgend	6,389,780.6	250,785,314.1	2.55
Caerphilly	12,979,594.6	277,387,807.1	4.68
Cardiff	86,701.0	142,303,613.2	0.06
Carmarthenshire	3,260,850.9	2,371,104,044.6	0.14
Ceredigion		1,788,379,261.9	
Conwy		1,130,179,030.9	
Denbighshire		838,716,213.4	
Flintshire	524,639.6	439,830,305.3	0.12
Gwynedd		2,548,292,895.1	
Isle of Anglesey	16,788.4	715,212,551.9	0.00
Merthyr Tydfil	6,202,440.7	111,956,970.9	5.54
Monmouthshire	1,477,824.8	850,327,720.8	0.17
Neath Port Talbot	10,069,362.2	442,272,629.1	2.28
Newport		190,431,147.3	
Pembrokeshire	256,044.6	1,618,344,480.4	0.02
Powys	3,238,642.5	5,195,311,063.6	0.06
Rhondda Cynon Taf	22,096,750.6	424,150,476.0	5.21
Swansea	1,853,622.8	377,614,545.0	0.49
Torfaen	4,059,955.6	126,239,929.8	3.22
Vale of Glamorgan		331,261,382.6	
Wrexham	3,037,868.8	503,773,535.2	0.60
Total (Wales)	86,148,131.0	20,782,602,964.4	0.41

Table 2: discounting for use in the avoided cost benefit calculation

2023 (%)	2022 (%)	2021 (%)	2020 (%)	2019 (%)	2018 (%)	2017 (%)	2016 (%)	2015 (%)	2014 (%)	2013 (%)	2012 (%)	2011 (%)
1.57	2.52	6.68	-0.80	4.45	2.36	2.11	1.57	2.27	0.72	1.22	1.92	1.84
101.57	104.13	111.09	110.20	115.10	117.82	120.30	122.19	124.97	125.87	127.40	129.85	132.24

Table 3: avoidable costs benefits using local authority data

Tip slips	FY	Value of works		In 2024 prices*
Tylors town	2019	12,000,000		13,812,058.83
Wattstown	2020	700,000		771,377.15
Graig Ddu	2020	4,425,000		4,876,205.55
Cilfynydd	2014	4,425,000		5,569,528.46
Cwm cynon	2020	3,000,000		3,305,902.07
Penrhiwceiber	2020	2,000,000		2,203,934.71
Llanmarch Llanelly	2020	75,000		82,647.55
Llwyn-On Colliery Tip A	2020	20,000		22,039.35
Llwyn y Ffynnon - Tip B	2018	15,000		17,672.53
Cynon Argoed Colliery - South Tip	2020	5,000		5,509.84
Argoed Colliery - Tip D	2020	20,000		22,039.35
Caroline	2018	35,000		41,235.90
Lady Margaret	2020	18,000		19,835.41
Pen Yr Englyn Eastern Tip	2020	4,262,775		4,697,438.89
Blaenrhondda	2020	35,000		38,568.86
Blaenycwm	1989	-		
Pen Rhiw House	2021	55,000		-
Pen Rhiw Colliery	2021	100,000		-
Total (10 years 2010-2020)	Cash:	31,190,775	2024 prices:	35,485,994.44
			Estimated avoidable cost per year (A):	3,548,599.44
			Over 12 years:	42,583,193.32

* Using Table 2 discounting

Table 4: Hatfield event

50-year event such as similar to Hatfield	(£)
Hatfield	65,000,000
In 2024 prices *	82,810,392.29
every x years	50
Yearly cost (B)	1,656,207.85
Over 12 years	19,874,494.15

* Using Table 2 discounting

Table 5: summary

Avoidable costs (A+B)		£5,204,807.29
Assumption that x is saved		80%*
Total avoidable costs per year		£4,163,845.83
Over 12 year window		£49,966,149.98

* Estimate of 80% impact of the avoidable costs as a result of mitigating measures and actions taken.

Table 6: welfare value benefits 2027 to 2032

Local authority	Welfare value	Tip coverage (%)*	2027 (£)	2028 (£)	2029 (£)	2030 (£)	2031 (£)	2032 (£)
Blaenau Gwent	9,391,005.89	9.75	0	915,301.66	915,301.66	915,301.66	915,301.66	915,301.66
Bridgend	24,112,423.04	2.55	0	614,362.50	614,362.50	614,362.50	614,362.50	614,362.50
Caerphilly	26,893,839.69	4.68	0	1,258,422.78	1,258,422.78	1,258,422.78	1,258,422.78	1,258,422.78
Cardiff	48,919,535.11	0.06	0	29,805.10	29,805.10	29,805.10	29,805.10	29,805.10
Carmarthenshire	28,408,092.00	0.14	0	39,068.11	39,068.11	39,068.11	39,068.11	39,068.11
Flintshire	25,197,684.00	0.12	0	30,056.37	30,056.37	30,056.37	30,056.37	30,056.37
Isle of Anglesey	17,013,857.00	0.00	0	399.37	399.37	399.37	399.37	399.37
Merthyr Tydfil	5,762,300.62	5.54	0	319,232.72	319,232.72	319,232.72	319,232.72	319,232.72
Monmouthshire	19,834,110.00	0.17	0	34,470.64	34,470.64	34,470.64	34,470.64	34,470.64
Neath Port Talbot	27,607,337.45	2.28	0	628,545.07	628,545.07	628,545.07	628,545.07	628,545.07
Pembrokeshire	29,736,301.00	0.02	0	4,704.70	4,704.70	4,704.70	4,704.70	4,704.70
Powys	29,397,394.00	0.06	0	18,325.69	18,325.69	18,325.69	18,325.69	18,325.69
RCT	23,897,273.35	5.21	0	1,244,964.04	1,244,964.04	1,244,964.04	1,244,964.04	1,244,964.04
Swansea	58,061,091.07	0.49	0	£285,008.52	285,008.52	285,008.52	285,008.52	285,008.52
Torfaen	13,558,224.69	3.22	0	£436,041.04	436,041.04	436,041.04	436,041.04	436,041.04
Wrexham	18,485,486.00	0.60	0	£111,471.68	111,471.68	111,471.68	111,471.68	111,471.68
Welfare benefits (16 LAs)	406,275,954.90		Total	5,970,179.98	5,970,179.98	5,970,179.98	5,970,179.98	5,970,179.98
All of Wales	569,177,928.00		Discounted total	5,202,414.83	5,026,891.54	4,856,741.41	4,692,561.46	4,533,754.68
			Lower Estimate – 25%	2,985,089.99	2,985,089.99	2,985,089.99	2,985,089.99	2,985,089.99
			discounted	2,601,207.42	2,513,445.77	2,428,370.71	2,346,280.73	2,266,877.34
			Central Estimate - 50%	2,985,089.99	2,985,089.99	2,985,089.99	2,985,089.99	2,985,089.99
			discounted	2,601,207.42	2,513,445.77	2,428,370.71	2,346,280.73	2,266,877.34
			Higher Estimate - 75%	2,985,089.99	2,985,089.99	2,985,089.99	2,985,089.99	2,985,089.99
			Discounted	2,601,207.42	2,513,445.77	2,428,370.71	2,346,280.73	2,266,877.34

* Using table one

Table 6 continued: welfare value benefits 2033 to 2040

Local authority	2033 (£)	2034 (£)	2035 (£)	2036 (£)	2037 (£)	2038 (£)	2039 (£)	2040 (£)	Total (£)
Blaenau Gwent	915,301.66	915,301.66	915,301.66	915,301.66	915,301.66	915,301.66	915,301.66	915,301.66	915,301.66
Bridgend	614,362.50	614,362.50	614,362.50	614,362.50	614,362.50	614,362.50	614,362.50	614,362.50	614,362.50
Caerphilly	1,258,422.78	1,258,422.78	1,258,422.78	1,258,422.78	1,258,422.78	1,258,422.78	1,258,422.78	1,258,422.78	1,258,422.78
Cardiff	29,805.10	29,805.10	29,805.10	29,805.10	29,805.10	29,805.10	29,805.10	29,805.10	29,805.10
Carmarthenshire	39,068.11	39,068.11	39,068.11	39,068.11	39,068.11	39,068.11	39,068.11	39,068.11	39,068.11
Flintshire	30,056.37	30,056.37	30,056.37	30,056.37	30,056.37	30,056.37	30,056.37	30,056.37	30,056.37
Isle of Anglesey	399.37	399.37	399.37	399.37	399.37	399.37	399.37	399.37	399.37
Merthyr Tydfil	319,232.72	319,232.72	319,232.72	319,232.72	319,232.72	319,232.72	319,232.72	319,232.72	319,232.72
Monmouthshire	34,470.64	34,470.64	34,470.64	34,470.64	34,470.64	34,470.64	34,470.64	34,470.64	34,470.64
Neath Port Talbot	628,545.07	628,545.07	628,545.07	628,545.07	628,545.07	628,545.07	628,545.07	628,545.07	628,545.07
Pembrokeshire	4,704.70	4,704.70	4,704.70	4,704.70	4,704.70	4,704.70	4,704.70	4,704.70	4,704.70
Powys	18,325.69	18,325.69	18,325.69	18,325.69	18,325.69	18,325.69	18,325.69	18,325.69	18,325.69
RCT	1,244,964.04	1,244,964.04	1,244,964.04	1,244,964.04	1,244,964.04	1,244,964.04	1,244,964.04	1,244,964.04	1,244,964.04
Swansea	285,008.52	285,008.52	285,008.52	285,008.52	285,008.52	285,008.52	285,008.52	285,008.52	285,008.52
Torfaen	436,041.04	436,041.04	436,041.04	436,041.04	436,041.04	436,041.04	436,041.04	436,041.04	436,041.04
Wrexham	111,471.68	111,471.68	111,471.68	111,471.68	111,471.68	111,471.68	111,471.68	111,471.68	111,471.68
Total	5,970,179.98	77,612,340.72							
Discounted total	4,380,321.05	4,232,260.59	4,088,976.27	3,951,065.11	3,817,333.08	3,688,377.19	3,563,600.43	3,443,002.79	55,477,300.43
Lower Estimate - 25%	1,492,544.99	1,492,544.99	1,492,544.99	1,492,544.99	1,492,544.99	1,492,544.99	1,492,544.99	1,492,544.99	19,403,084.93
Discounted	1,095,080.26	1,058,065.15	1,022,244.07	987,766.28	954,333.27	922,094.30	890,900.11	860,750.70	13,869,325.11
Central Estimate - 50%	2,985,089.99	2,985,089.99	2,985,089.99	2,985,089.99	2,985,089.99	2,985,089.99	2,985,089.99	2,985,089.99	38,806,169.86
Discounted	2,190,160.53	2,116,130.29	2,044,488.13	1,975,532.55	1,908,666.54	1,844,188.60	1,781,800.21	1,721,501.40	27,738,650.22
Higher Estimate - 75%	4,477,634.98	4,477,634.98	4,477,634.98	4,477,634.98	4,477,634.98	4,477,634.98	4,477,634.98	4,477,634.98	58,209,254.79
Discounted	3,285,240.79	3,174,195.44	3,066,732.20	2,963,298.83	2,862,999.81	2,766,282.89	2,672,700.32	2,582,252.10	41,607,975.32

* Using table one

Table 7: indirect employment benefits 2025 to 2031

The minimum wage figure of £20,048 is used to ascertain the quantifiable employment benefit as a result of the number of new jobs created.

Local authority	Employment	Tip coverage (%) *	Average annual growth rate 2011-2020 (%)	Specific Growth Factor (%)	New jobs	2025 (£)	2026 (£)	2027 (£)	2028 (£)	2029 (£)	2030 (£)	2031 (£)
Blaenau Gwent	31,100	9.75	1.3	0.13	39.9	0	0	0	799,816	799,816	799,816	799,816
Bridgend	65,200	2.55	0.7	0.02	12.3	0	0	0	246,119	246,119	246,119	246,119
Caerphilly	85,100	4.68	1.8	0.09	72.6	0	0	0	1,454,987	1,454,987	1,454,987	1,454,987
Cardiff	185,600	0.06	2.0	0.00	2.2	0	0	0	44,393	44,393	44,393	44,393
Carmarthenshire	78,400	0.14	0.3	0.00	0.3	0	0	0	6,359	6,359	6,359	6,359
Flintshire	78,200	0.12	1.0	0.00	0.9	0	0	0	18,675	18,675	18,675	18,675
Isle of Anglesey	30,600	0.00	0.1	0.00	0.0	0	0	0	17	17	17	17
Merthyr Tydfil	24,200	5.54	0.1	0.01	1.5	0	0	0	30,293	30,293	30,293	30,293
Monmouthshire	45,400	0.17	0.9	0.00	0.7	0	0	0	14,868	14,868	14,868	14,868
Neath Port Talbot	61,500	2.28	1.0	0.02	14.4	0	0	0	288,589	288,589	288,589	288,589
Pembrokeshire	55,700	0.02	0.9	0.00	0.1	0	0	0	1,667	1,667	1,667	1,667
Powys	60,700	0.06	0.1	0.00	0.0	0	0	0	663	663	663	663
RCT	99,800	5.21	0.6	0.03	29.1	0	0	0	582,868	582,868	582,868	582,868
Swansea	113,400	0.49	1.7	0.01	9.5	0	0	0	189,583	189,583	189,583	189,583
Torfaen	41,000	3.22	0.7	0.02	9.3	0	0	0	185,660	185,660	185,660	185,660
Wrexham	64,400	0.60	0.3	0.00	1.1	0	0	0	21,999	21,999	21,999	21,999
Totals	1,120,300.00				193.9**	0	0	0	3,886,555	3,886,555	3,886,555	3,886,555
All of Wales	1,432,700.00					0	0	0	3,386,744	3,272,480	3,161,713	3,054,833

* Using table one

** 193.9 is the sum of new jobs across 16 local authorities. This represents approximately 0.01% of the number of people in employment in Wales, or 0.02% across the 16 local authorities with disused coal tips.

Table 8 continued: indirect employment benefits 2032 to 2040

Local authority	2032 (£)	2033 (£)	2034 (£)	2035 (£)	2036 (£)	2037 (£)	2038 (£)	2039 (£)	2040 (£)	Total (£)
Blaenau Gwent	799,816	799,816	799,816	799,816	799,816	799,816	799,816	799,816	799,816	
Bridgend	246,119	246,119	246,119	246,119	246,119	246,119	246,119	246,119	246,119	
Caerphilly	1,454,987	1,454,987	1,454,987	1,454,987	1,454,987	1,454,987	1,454,987	1,454,987	1,454,987	
Cardiff	44,393	44,393	44,393	44,393	44,393	44,393	44,393	44,393	44,393	
Carmarthenshire	6,359	6,359	6,359	6,359	6,359	6,359	6,359	6,359	6,359	
Flintshire	18,675	18,675	18,675	18,675	18,675	18,675	18,675	18,675	18,675	
Isle of Anglesey	17	17	17	17	17	17	17	17	17	
Merthyr Tydfil	30,293	30,293	30,293	30,293	30,293	30,293	30,293	30,293	30,293	
Monmouthshire	14,868	14,868	14,868	14,868	14,868	14,868	14,868	14,868	14,868	
Neath Port Talbot	288,589	288,589	288,589	288,589	288,589	288,589	288,589	288,589	288,589	
Pembrokeshire	1,667	1,667	1,667	1,667	1,667	1,667	1,667	1,667	1,667	
Powys	663	663	663	663	663	663	663	663	663	
RCT	582,868	582,868	582,868	582,868	582,868	582,868	582,868	582,868	582,868	
Swansea	189,583	189,583	189,583	189,583	189,583	189,583	189,583	189,583	189,583	
Torfaen	185,660	185,660	185,660	185,660	185,660	185,660	185,660	185,660	185,660	
Wrexham	21,999	21,999	21,999	21,999	21,999	21,999	21,999	21,999	21,999	
Totals	3,886,555	50,525,220								
Discounted totals	2,951,450	2,851,566	2,755,179	2,661,902	2,572,122	2,485,064	2,401,114	2,319,885	2,241,377	36,115,427

* Using table one

Table 10 continued: summary of benefits 2034 to 2040

	2033 (£)	2034 (£)	2035 (£)	2036 (£)	2037 (£)	2038 (£)	2039 (£)	2040 (£)	Total (£)
Total avoidable costs	4,163,845.83	4,163,845.83	4,163,845.83	4,163,845.83	4,163,845.83	4,163,845.83	4,163,845.83	4,163,845.83	54,129,995.81
discounted avoidable costs	3,055,013.69	2,951,750.31	2,851,818.01	2,755,633.17	2,662,363.02	2,572,423.95	2,485,399.58	2,401,289.89	38,692,121.01
welfare benefits	2,985,089.99	2,985,089.99	2,985,089.99	2,985,089.99	2,985,089.99	2,985,089.99	2,985,089.99	2,985,089.99	38,806,169.86
discounted welfare benefits	2,190,160.53	2,116,130.29	2,044,488.13	1,975,532.55	1,908,666.54	1,844,188.60	1,781,800.21	1,721,501.40	27,738,650.22
indirect employment benefits	3,886,555.41	3,886,555.41	3,886,555.41	3,886,555.41	3,886,555.41	3,886,555.41	3,886,555.41	3,886,555.41	50,525,220.29
discounted indirect benefits	2,851,565.70	2,755,179.13	2,661,901.80	2,572,122.37	2,485,063.53	2,401,113.93	2,319,884.92	2,241,376.50	36,115,427.46
Total benefits	11,035,491.23	143,461,385.96							
Total discounted benefits	8,096,739.91	7,823,059.73	7,558,207.94	7,303,288.09	7,056,093.09	6,817,726.48	6,587,084.71	6,364,167.79	102,546,198.68

Table 11: summary of quantified benefits

Type	Totals (£ millions)
Avoided costs	54.1
Welfare value	38.8
Employment	50.5
Total	143.4

Table 10: discount rates

Standard Discount Rates and Associated Discount Factors from the green book			
Year	Discount Rate	Discount Factor	Year
0		1	2024
1	3.50%	0.9662	2025
2	3.50%	0.9335	2026
3	3.50%	0.9019	2027
4	3.50%	0.8714	2028
5	3.50%	0.842	2029
6	3.50%	0.8135	2030
7	3.50%	0.786	2031
8	3.50%	0.7594	2032
9	3.50%	0.7337	2033
10	3.50%	0.7089	2034
11	3.50%	0.6849	2035
12	3.50%	0.6618	2036
13	3.50%	0.6394	2037
14	3.50%	0.6178	2038
15	3.50%	0.5969	2039
16	3.50%	0.5767	2040

The above table is used where figures have been discounted for a particular year.

Annex 2: staff costs breakdown

Table 1: staff costs rates

2023-24								
	Including On Costs				Breakdown of annual salary			
Salaries	Annual cost (£)	Monthly cost (£)	Weekly cost (£)	hourly cost (£)	Basic (£)	Ers NICs (£)	Ers Pension (£)	Total Annual Cost (£)
SCS3	189,592	15,799.33	3,646.00	97.23	133,675	17,192	38,726	189,593
SCS2	163,417	13,618.08	3,142.63	83.80	116,042	14,759	33,617	164,418
SCS1	127,981	10,665.08	2,461.17	65.63	90,520	11,237	26,224	127,980
Grade 6 (uplift)	123,773	10,314.43	2,380.25	63.47	87,573	10,830	25,370	123,773
Grade 6	112,521	9,376.75	2,163.87	57.70	79,696	9,743	23,088	112,527
Grade 7 (uplift)	102,128	8,510.70	1,964.01	52.37	72,410	8,737	20,977	102,125
Grade 7	92,844	7,737.00	1,785.46	47.61	65,910	7,840	19,094	92,844
SEO (uplift)	78,518	6,543.17	1,509.96	40.27	55,875	6,456	16,187	78,517
SEO	71,380	5,948.33	1,372.69	36.61	51,839	5,899	15,018	72,755
HEO (uplift)	62,765	5,230.41	1,207.02	32.19	44,841	4,933	12,990	62,764
HEO	57,059	4,754.92	1,097.29	29.26	41,675	4,496	12,073	58,244
EO (uplift)	48,991	4,082.56	942.13	25.12	35,194	3,602	10,196	48,991
EO	44,537	3,711.42	856.48	22.84	32,500	3,230	8,808	44,537
Board Chair	12,288	N/A	N/A	N/A				
Non-exec director	9,504	N/A	N/A	N/A				

